The Application of Diatom Indices in the Upper Porsuk Creek Kütahya -Turkey

Cüneyt Nadir Solak^{1,*}

¹ Dumlup mar University, Fen Edebiyat Fakültesi, Biyoloji Bölümü, 43100 Kütahya, Türkiye.

* Corresponding Author: Tel.: +90.537 6002222; Fax: +90.274 2652056;	Received 03 December 2008
E-mail: cnadirs@dumlupinar.edu.tr	Accepted 23 September 2010

Abstract

In this study, the epilithic diatoms were investigated monthly to reveal the water quality of Upper Porsuk Creek. The Samples were collected from three stations between December 2004 and August 2005. In this study, a total of 57 diatom taxa were found along the creek. The water quality of Upper Porsuk Creek was determined according to these taxa. Different diatom indices (SLA- Sládecěk Index-, EPI-D-Eutrophication/Pollution Index, TDI-Trophic Diatom Index- and DESCY-Descy Index) were used in this study. There were significant differences among three stations with regard to diatom index values. Also, the diatom indices were compared with each other and it was found that the correlation coefficients between the indices were quite high.

Keywords: Benthic diatom, diatom indices, Porsuk Creek, water quality.

Diyatome İndekslerinin Yukarı Porsuk Çayı'nda, Kütahya-Türkiye Uygulanması

Özet

Bu çalışmada, Yukarı Porsuk Çayı'nın su kalitesinin belirlenmesi amacıyla epilitik diyatome örnekler Aralık 2004 ile Ağustos 2005 tarihleri arasında aylık olarak incelenmiştir. Çalışma sonucunda, toplam 57 diyatome türü tespit edilmiş ve Porsuk Çay'nın su kalitesi bu türlere göre SLA- Sládecěk İndeksi, EPI-D-Ötrofikasyon-Kirlilik İndeksi, TDI-Trofik Diyatome İndeksi and DESCY-Descy İndeksi kullanılarak tespit edilmiştir. İndeks değerlerine göre, üç istasyon arasında belirgin farklılıklar ve yine, indeksler arasında da önemli korelasyon olduğu gözlenmiştir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Bentik diatom, diatom indekleri, Porsuk Çayı, su kalitesi.

Introduction

Algae are the essential components of primer productivity in aquatic ecosystems. These organisms are the sources of essential oxygen for aquatic life. Diatoms are so ecologically important that they are used for monitoring environmental conditions of waters. They indicate water quality level of many aquatic environments. Diatoms have been used in a number of countries as indicators of river pollution (Whitton et al., 1991; Whitton and Kelly, 1995; Whitton and Rott, 1996; Stevenson and Pan, 1999; Ács et al., 2003, 2004, 2006; Blanco et al., 2004; Gomá et al., 2004; Szabó et al., 2004; Gosselain et al., 2005), but this topic is still new in Turkey; Sariçay (Barlas et al., 2001), Akçapınar and Kadın Azmağı (Barlas et al., 2002) in Muğla; Aksu (Kalyoncu, 2002) stream in Isparta was investigated by using Saprobity Index (Zelinka and Marvan,

1961). Also, Gürbüz and Kıvrak (2002) practised firstly three different indices (TDI, SI and IDG) on Karasu River (Erzurum) while, OMNIDIA software program was firstly used by Solak *et al.* (2007) for Akçay stream (Muğla) in Turkey (Solak, 2009). Also, Kalyoncu *et al.* (2009) compared the performance of three types of benthic diatom index (Swiss Diatom Index (DI-CH), Trophic Index (TI) and Saprobic Index (SI)) in Isparta streams and they concluded that in these rivers, DI-CH and TI could be more useful than SI. The aims of this study are testing the use of epilithic diatoms as indicators and the use of diatom indices as a tool for estimating the creek water quality.

Materials and Methods

Porsuk River orginates in the Western Anatolian Plateau near Tokul village at the altitude of 1,170 m

[©] Published by Central Fisheries Research Institute (CFRI) Trabzon, Turkey in cooperation with Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA), Japan

and flows eastwards for 435.5 km until it empties into the Sakarya River at the altitude 600 m. The river flows through two big cities, Kütahya and Eskişehir. The river receives the manicipal wastes, wastes from sugar beet factory, fertilizer plants, the magnezite factory, the slaughter house and other industrial establishments from the city of Kütahya and joins the Porsuk Dam. The dam is 140 km from the source of the river (Yıldız, 1987; Çınar et al., 1999). In this study, diatom samples were collected monthly from three stations, selected from its source to Porsuk Dam, between December 2003 and August 2004. The 1st station (P1) was entrance of Kütahya Province. DSI regulatory was selected as the 2nd station (P2). The 3rd station (P3) was out side of Kütahya Province towards Porsuk Dam (Figure 1). Diatoms were collected by scraping 20 cm² area stones. They were cleaned with acid (HNO₃) and mounted on microscopie for observation with a magnification of 1000X. Three slides were prepared for each site and approximately 200 valves enumerated in each slide to determine the relative abundance of each taxa and identified according to Krammer and Lange-Bertalot (1986, 1988, 1991a, 1991b), Round (1990), Sims (1996) and then DESCY, SLA, TDI and EPI-D were calculated for each station.

Diatom Indices

Zelinka and Marvan (1961) developed an index to assess water quality with algae (among which diatoms);

$$ID = \sum_{\substack{i=1 \\ j=1}}^{n} Aj . Ij . Vj / \sum_{\substack{i=1 \\ j=1}}^{n} Aj . Vj$$

with Aj; species abundance, Ij; pollution index of species, Vj; indicative value or stenoecy degree of the species.

The index of Zelinka and Marvan served as a basis for several indices:

1. DESCY index: 5 classes of sensitivity, 106 species are used.

2. TDI index: 5 classes of sensitivity of trophic state and 3 classes of reliability are used. This index is widely used in the United Kingdom, and is part of a suite of techniques used to detect eutrophication in rivers caused by large, predominantly lowland sewage Works.

3. EPI index: the sensitivity of species is an integrated index from 0 to 4, and reliability from 1 to 5.

4. SLA index: 5 classes of sensitivity (from 0 to 4), 323 species are used.

Results

In this study, a total of 57 diatom taxa were identificated belonging to Bacillariophyta (Table 1). The most abundant taxa were Nitzschia palea (Kützing) W. Smith, Achnanthidium minutissimum Kützing, Diatoma vulgaris Bory, Cymbella affinis Kützing and Planothidium lanceolatum (Brébisson ex Kützing) Lange-Bertalot. The pollution stituation of Upper Porsuk Creek was determined considering diatom indices. According to TDI value, P1 and P2 stations were II quality while P3 was V quality. EPI values were III quality for P1; were IV quality for P2 and were V quality for P3 station. DESCY values were II quality for P1 and P2 stations, whereas were V quality for P3 station. SLA values were III quality for P1 and P2 stations, but were IV quality for P3 station (Table 2; Figure 2).

There were significant negative correlation between DESCY and other indices (with SLA index (** P<0.01 (n=8)); with TDI and EPI-D indices (* P<0.05 (n=8)) while, there was no significant correlation between other indices (Table 3).



Figure 1. Map of Upper Porsuk Creek and the sampling stations along the creek.

Table 1. The List of Upper Porsuk Creek Diatoms

Phyllum: Bacillariophyta	
Classis: Coscinodiscophyceae	Family: Gomphonemataceae
Order: Thalassiosirales	Gomphonema augur Ehrenberg
Family: Stephanodiscaceae	Gomphonema minutum (C.Agardh) C.Agardh
Cyclotella meneghiana Kützing	Gomphonema olivaceum (Hornemann) Brébisson
Family: Melosiraceae	Gomphonema parvulum (Kützing) Kützing
Melosira lineata (Dillwyn) C.Agardh	Reimeria sinuata (Gregory) Kociolek et Stoermer
Melosira varians C.Agardh	Family: Rhoicospheniaceae
Classis: Bacillariophyceae	Rhoicosphenia abbreviata (Agardh) Lange-Bertalot
Family : Fragilariaceae	Family: Naviculaceae
Diatoma tenuis C. Agardh	Navicula capitatoradiata Germain
Ulnaria acus (Kützing) Aboal in Aboal	Navicula cari Ehrenberg
Ulnaria biceps (Kützing) P. Compére	Navicula exigua Gregory
Ulnaria ulna (Nitzschia) P. Compére	Navicula radiosa Kützing
(Kützing) Czarnecki	Navicula tripunctata (O.F.Müller) Bory
Order: Achnanthales	Navicula veneta Kützing
Family: Achnanthidiaceae	Family: Pinnulariaceae
Achnanthidium minutissimum (Kützing) Czarnecki	Pinnularia viridis (Nitzsch) Ehrenberg
Planothidium lanceolatum (Brébbisson ex Kützing) Lange-Bertalot	Family: Pleurosigmataceae
Family: Cocconeidaceae	Gyrosigma sciotense (W.Sç Sullivant) Cleve
Cocconeis pediculus Ehrenberg	Family: Sellaphoraceae
Cocconeis placentula Ehrenberg	Fallacia pygmaea (Kützing) A.J.Stickle et D.G.Mann
Order: Bacillariales	Sellaphora pupula (Kützing) Mereschkowsky
Denticula elegans Kützing	Family: Stauroneidaceae
Nitzschia amphibia Grunow	Craticula cuspidata (Kützing) D.G. Mann
Nitzschia dissipata (Kützing) Grunow	Family : Rhopalodiaceae
Nitzschia flexa Schumann	Rhopalodia gibberula (Ehrenberg)O.Müller
Nitzschia incrustans Grunow	Family: Surirellaceae
Nitzschia linearis (Agardh) W. Smith	Campylodiscus hibernicus Ehrenberg
Nitzschia palea (Kützing) W. Smith	Cymatopleura elliptica (Brébisson) W. Smith
Nitzschia recta Hantzsch ex Rabenhorst	Cymatopleura solea (Brébisson) W. Smith
Nitzschia sigmoidea (Nitzsch) W. Smith	Surirella angusta Kützing
Nitzschia subacicularis Hustedt	Surirella ovata Kützing
Nitzschia sublinearis Hustedt in Schmidt	Surirella ovalis Brébisson
Nitzschia vermicularis (Kützing) Hantzsch in Rabenhorst	Surirella robusta Ehrenberg
Tryblionella apiculata Gregory	Order: Thallassiophysales
Family: Cymbellaceae	Family : Catenulaceae
Cymbella affinis Kützing	Amphora ovalis (Kützing) Kützing
Cymbella aspera (Ehrenberg) H.Peragello	Amphora pediculus (Kützing) Grunow ex Schmidt
Cymbella helvetica Kützing	· · ·
Cymbella tumidula Grunow	
<i>Cymbopleura naviculiformis</i> (Auerswald) Krammer	
Encyonema silesiacum (Bleisch) D.G. Mann	

Table 2. Water Quality Values of Upper Porsuk Creek According to Different Diatom In	ndices
--	--------

Distomindices		Stations	
Diatominutes	P1	P2	P3
TDI	II (39)	II (44.5)	V (121.3)
EPI	III (1.55)	IV (1.81)	V (2.01)
	Fairly good quality	Weakly good quality	Moderately polluted
DESCY	II (4.06)	II (4.01)	V (1.81)
	Slight pollution	Slight pollution	Very heavy pollution
SLA	III (1.92)	III (2.02)	IV (2.48)
	Low polluted	Low pollluted	Critical polluted

Discussions

Whereas members of Nitzschia genus were the highest density among the genera, other high membered genera were Navicula and Cymbella. According to Kalyoncu (1996), Cymbella was the most intense genera in respect of species number after this genus, Nitzschia, Navicula and Gomphonema



Figure 2. Changes in the diatom indices at three sampling sites along the creek.

 Table 3. Canonical correlation coefficients between physical-chemical variables of water at sampling sites of Upper Porsuk

 Creek

	TDI	EPI-D	DESCY	SI
TDI	1			
EPI-D	0.593	1		
DESCY	-0.636	-0.661	1	
SLA	0.542	0.556	-0.825	1

were other high members in Isparta Creek. Yıldız and Özkıran (1991) reported that the species of *Navicula*, *Nitzschia*, *Cymbella*, *Surirella*, *Gomphonema* and *Pinnularia* were the most abundant in Kızılırmak River. Also, Barlas *et al.* (2001) had reported a similar result in Sarıçay Creek.

Diatoma tenuis C. Agardh, Achnanthidium minutissimum and Gomphonema olivaceum (Hornemann) Brebbisson were the most dominant taxa in the 1st station. Gürbüz and Kıvrak (2002) had found Cymbella affinis and Achnanthidium minutissimum especially in unpolluted areas, upper basin of streams, so these taxa were sensitive-organic pollution taxa (Nather Khan, 1990; Kelly, 1998; Kwandrans et al., 1998; Gómez and Licursi, 2001; Steinberg and Schiefele, 1988; Solak et al., 2005; Solak et al., 2007). Krstić et al. (1999) reported that, Gomphonema olivaceum was a typical taxon of α - β mesosaprobic condition. Achnanthidium minutissimum and Nitzschia linearis W. Smith were the most abundant taxa in the 2nd station. According to Cox (1996), Nitzschia linearis was found commonly in β-α-mesosaprobic condition. Nitzschia palea, Melosira varians C. Agardh, Navicula *capitatoradiata* Germain, Craticula cuspidata (Kützing) D.G. Mann and Nitzschia dissipata (Kützing) Grunow were the most abundant taxa in the 3rd station. Among these taxa, the dominance value of Nitzschia palea, resistant to organic pollution (Lange-Bertalot, 1978, 1979a, 1979b; Descy, 1979; Barlas, 1988; Steinberg and Schiefele, 1988; Klee, 1991; Kelly, 1998), was less than 1% in the 1^{st} and 2^{nd} stations while higher than 52% in the 3rd. According to Cox (1996), this taxon was found in α -mesosaprob to polysaprobic condition. Another dominant taxon was Melosira varians. According to the same author, this taxon was dominant especially in eutrophic waters. According to Krstić et al. (1999), Nitzschia dissipata was found in α - β -mesosaprobic and Navicula *capitatoradiata* in β - α -mesosaprobic condition. Also, another important result from this station was that *Planothidium lanceolatum* was only found in this station.

According to diatom indices, water quality levels were found different between stations. When considering the TDI index, P1 and P2 were under eutrophication threat while P3 was eutrophic, very polluted and approximately three time higher eutrophied than other stations. According to the EPI-D index, P1 revealed fairly good quality while P2 was weakly good quality while P3 was in a moderately polluted quality. According to the DESCY index, P1 and P2 were slightly polluted but P3 was very heavily polluted and there were some dominant taxa in the community at this station. The SLA index showed low pollution in P1 and P2 but a critical pollution stituation in P3.

In conclusion, the dominance of identified taxa revealed different positions among the stations in which some taxa were dominant in the upper sections of the creek while others were dominant in the lower parts. Also, according to diatom indices, water quality levels were found in different levels between stations. According to author's opinion, these differencies resulted from the alteration of diatom communities in the indices. Water quality monitoring based on diatom indices is still a new topic in Turkey; and will be getting more improved with new the research in the near future. For this reason, by doing more and more studies using the indices, I think that we can restructure the current monitoring procedures with respect to aquatic organisms like diatoms. Pollution in the creek increased throughtout the course according to the indices values.

References

- Ács, É., Szabó, K., Kiss, K.T. and Hindák, F. 2003. Benthic algal investigations in the Danube River and some of its main tributaries from Germany to Hungary. Biologia, 58: 545-554.
- Ács, É., Szabó, K., Tóth, B. and Kiss, K.T. 2004. Investigation of benthic algal communities, especially diatoms of some Hungarian Streams in connection with reference conditions of the Water Framework Directives. Acta Botanica Hungarica, 46(3-4): 255– 277.
- Ács, É., Szabó, K., Kiss, Á.K., Tóth, B., Záray, G.Y. and Kiss, K.T. 2006. Investigation of epilithic algae on the River Danube from Germany to Hungary and the effect of a very dry year on the algae of the River Danube. Arch. Hydrobiol. Suppl. Large Rivers, 16: 389-417.
- Barlas, M. 1988. Limnologische untersuchungen ander Fulda unter besonderer berücksichtigung der fischparasiten, Ihrer Wirtsspektren und der Wassergüte. Dissertation. PhD Thesis. Üniversität Kassel.
- Barlas, M., Mumcu, F., Dirican, S. and Solak, C.N. 2001. Sarıçay (Muğla-Milas)'da yaşayan epilitik diatomların su kalitesine bağlı olarak incelenmesi. IV. Ulusal Ekoloji ve Çevre Kongresi Bildiri Kitabı: 313-322.
- Barlas, M., Mumcu, M.F., Solak, C.N. and Çoban, O. 2002. Akçapınar Deresi ve Kadın Azmağı Deresi (Muğla) Epilitik Alg Florasının Su Kalitesine Bağlı Olarak İncelenmesi. 4-7 Eylül, Malatya VI. Ulusal Biyoloji Kongresi.
- Blanco, S., Ector, L. and Bécares, E. 2004. Epiphytic diatoms as water quality indicators in Spanish Shallow Lakes. Vie Milieu, 54(2-3): 71-79.
- Cox, E.J. 1996. Identification of Freshwater Diatoms From Live Material. Chapman & Hall, London, 158 pp.
- Çınar, A.G., Sarı, M., Sarıdağ, C. and Çetin, C. 1999 Kütahya İli Çevre Durum Raporu. Kütahya: Sağlık Bakanlığı, Kütahya Valiliği, İl Sağlık Müdürlüğü Yayını.

- Descy, J.P. 1979. A new approach to water quality estimating using diatoms. Nova Hedwigia, 64: 305-323.
- Gomá, J., Ortiz, R., Cambra, J. and Ector, L. 2004. Water quality evaluation in Catalonian Mediterranean Rivers using epilithic diatoms as bioindicators. Vie Milieu, 54(2-3): 81-90.
- Gosselain, V., Coste, M., Campeau, S., Ector, L., Fauville, C., Delmas, F., Knoflacher, M., Licursi, M., Rimet, F., Tison, J., Tudesque, L. and Descy, J.P. 2005. A large-scale stream benthic diatom database. Hydrobiologia, 542: 151-163.
- Gürbüz, H. and Kıvrak, E. 2002. Use of epilithic diatoms to evaluate water quality in the Karasu River of Turkey. J of Environmental Biology, 23 (3): 239-246.
- Gómez, N. and Licursi, M. 2001. The Pampean Diatom Index (IDP) for assessment of rivers and streams in Argentina. Aquatic Ecology, 35: 173-181.
- Kalyoncu, H. 1996. Isparta Çayı algleri üzerine bir araştırma, MSc. Thesis, Isparta: Süleyman Demirel University.
- Kalyoncu, H. 2002. Aksu Çayı'nın Fiziksel, Kimyasal ve Biyolojik Olarak İncelenmesi. PhD thesis, Isparta: Süleyman Demirel University, 155 pp.
- Kalyoncu, H., Çiçek, N.L., Akköz, C. and Yorulmaz, B. 2009. Comparative performance of diatom indices in aquatic pollution assessment. African Journal of Agricultural Research, 4(10): 1032-1040.
- Kelly, M.G. 1998. Use of the Trophic Diatom Index to monitor eutrophication in rivers. Wat. Res. 32(1): 236-242.
- Klee, O. 1991. Angewandte Hydrobiologie G. Theieme Verlag, 2. neubearbeitete und erweiterte Auflage, Stuttgart-New York, 272 pp.
- Krammer, K. and Lange-Bertalot, H. 1986.
 Bacillariophyceae, 1. Teil: Naviculaceae. In: H. Ettl,
 J. Gerloff, H. Heynig and D. Mollenhaues (Eds.),
 Süßwasserflora von Mitteleuropa, Band 2/1, G.
 Fischer Verlag, Stutgart, New York, 876 pp.
- Krammer, Κ. and Lange-Bertalot, H. 1988. Bacillariaceae, Bacillariophyceae, 2. Teil: Epithemiaceae, Surirellaceae. In: H. Ettl, J. Gerloff, H. Heynig, and D. M ollenhaues (Eds.), Süßwasserflora von Mitteleuropa, Band. 2/2, G. Fischer Verlag, Stutgart, New York.
- Krammer, K. and Lange-Bertalot, H. 1991a. Bacillariophyceae, 3. Teil: Centrales, Fragilariaceae, Eunotiaceae. In: H. Ettl, J. Gerloff, H. Heynig and D. Mollenhaues (Eds.), Süßwasserflora von Mitteleuropa, Band. 2/3, G. Fischer Verlag, Stutgart, New York, 576 pp.
- Krammer, K. and Lange-Bertalot, H. 1991b. Bacillariophyceae, 4. Teil: Achnanthaceae. Kritische Erganzungen zu Navicula (Lineolatae) und Gomphonema. In: H. Ettl, J. Gerloff, H. Heynig and D. Mollenhaues (Eds.), Süßwasserflora von Mitteleuropa, Band 2/4, G. Fischer Verlag, Stutgart, New York, 437 pp
- Krstić, S., Levkov, Z. and Stojanovski, P. 1999. Saprobiological characteristics of diatoms microflora in river ecosystems in the Republic of Macedonia as a parameter for determiation of the intensity of anthropogenic influence. In: J. Prygiel, BA. Whitton, J. Bukowska (Eds.), Use of Algae for Monitoring Rivers III. Douai: 145-153.
- Kwandrans, J.P., Elorenta, B., Kawecka, K. and Wojtan, K.

1998. Use of benthic diatom communities to evaluate water quality in rivers of Southern Poland. J. Appl. Phycol., 10: 193-201.

- Lange-Bertalot, H. 1978. Diatomeen-differentialarten anstelle von leitformen: ein geeigneteres kriterium der gewässerbelastung. Arch. Hydrobiol. Sppl. 51 Algal Studies, 21: 393-427.
- Lange-Bertalot, H. 1979a. Toleranz grenzen und Pollutionsdynamik benthicher diatomeen bei unterschiedlich staker abwasserblastung. Arch. Hydrobiol. Algological Studies, 23: 184-219.
- Lange-Bertalot, H. 1979b. Pollution tolerance of diatoms as a criterion water quality estimation. Nova Hedwigia. Beiheft. 64: 285-303.
- Nather Khan, I.S.A. 1990. Assessment of water pollution using diatom community structure and species distribution-A case study in a tropical river basin. Int. Revue Ges. Hydrobiol., 75: 317-338.
- Round, F.E., Crawford, R.M. and Mann, D.G. 1990. The diatoms: biology and morphology of the genera. Cambridge University Press: London, UK., 747 pp.
- Sims, P.A. 1996. An Atlas of British Diatoms. Biopress Ltd, Dorchester, UK, 601 pp.
- Solak, C.N., Barlas, M. and Pabucçu, K. 2005. Akçay'daki (Muğla-Denizli) bazı epilitik diyatome taksonlarının mevsimsel gelişimi. D.P.Ü. Fen Bilimleri Dergisi, 8: 211-218.
- Solak, C.N., Fehér, G., Barlas, M. and Pabuçcu, K. 2007. Use of epilithic diatoms to evaluate water quality of Akçay Stream (Büyük Menderes River) in Mugla/Turkey. Archiv Für Hydrobiologie Suppl., 161 (3-4), Large Rivers, 17(3-4): 327-338.

- Solak, C.N. 2009. Felent Çayı'ndaki kirliliğin bazı akuatik organizmalara bağlı olarak incelenmesi. PhD thesis. Kütahya: Dumlupınar University.
- Steinberg, C. and Schiefele, S. 1988. Biological indication of trophy and pollution of running waters. 2. Wasser – Abwasser – Frosch., 21: 227-234.
- Stevenson, R.J. and Pan, Y. 1999. Assessing environmental conditions in rivers and streams with diatoms. In: E.F. Stoermer and J.P. Smol (Eds.), The Diatoms. Applications for the Environmental and Earth Sciences. Cambridge: 11-40.
- Szabó, K., Kiss, K.T., Ector, L., Kecskés, M. and Ács, É. 2004. Benthic diatom flora in a small Hungarian tributary of River Danube (Rákos-stream). Archiv für Hydrobiologie Suppl., 150 Algological Studies, 111: 79-94.
- Whitton, B.A., Rott, E. and Friedrich, G. 1991. Use of Algae for Monitoring Rivers. Proc. Internat. Symp., Dusseldorf, 193 pp.
- Whitton, B.A. and Kelly, M.G. 1995. Use of algae and other plants for monitoring rivers. Aust. J. Ecol., 20:45-56.
- Whitton, B.A. and Rott, E. 1996. Use of Algae for Monitoring Rivers II. In Proc. II International Symposium. 17-19 September, Innsburck, 196 pp.
- Yıldız, K. 1987. Diatoms of the Porsuk River, Turkey. Doğa Tr. J. Biol., 11(3): 162-182.
- Yıldız, K. and Özkıran, Ü. 1991. Kızılırmak Nehri diyatomeleri. Doğa Tr. J. of Botany, 15: 166-188.
- Zelinka, M. and Marvan, P. 1961. Zur Präzisierung der biologischen Klassifikation der Reinheit flieβender Gewässer.-Arch. Hydrobiol., 57: 389-407